

Angelika Enderlein, Monika Flacke

## **Database on the Munich Central Collecting Point**

This sizable database bringing together property cards and photographs of art objects that passed through the Munich Central Collecting Point (MCCP) goes online (<http://www.dhm.de/datenbank/ccp/>) just a few months after the tenth anniversary of the Washington Principles. Following the German Historical Museum's Internet presentation of the *Sonderauftrag Linz* (Special Commission Linz) database (<http://www.dhm.de/datenbank/linzdb/>) in the summer of 2008, this is a further important step in opening the archives concerning the National Socialist cultural policy to a wide public.

While the *Sonderauftrag Linz* database already serves provenance research by significantly expanding its available investigative instruments and helping to close existing gaps, the MCCP database with 170,000 entries and some 300,000 images (property cards and photographs) will shed further light on the history of the items before and after 1945.

It is thanks to the cooperation of the Bundesamt für zentrale Dienste und offene Vermögensfragen (BADV) [Federal Office for Central Services and Unresolved Property Issues], the Bundesarchiv [Federal Archive], the Bundesfinanzministerium (BMF) [Federal Ministry of Finance], the Deutsches Historisches Museum (DHM) [German Historical Museum], the Zuse Institute Berlin (ZIB) as well as the Zentrum für Informationsverarbeitung und Informationstechnik (ZIVIT) [Central Information Processing and Information Technology], office Berlin, that this database could go online in the first place. Initially, it was these institutions' cooperatives efforts that made it possible for the BMF and BADV staff members to digitally scan the property cards from the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz, creating the data files that the DHM—working with the ZIB and the ZIVIT—then processed and now presents on its website at no charge.

This data is complemented by the additional property cards and original black-and-white photographs from the BADV archive as well as property cards held by the Bundesdenkmalamt [Federal Office for the Care of Monuments] in Vienna.

The Munich Central Collecting Point was the name given to the collection center for art set up by the American allied forces' Monuments, Fine Arts and Archives Service (MFA&A) in the former National Socialist Party buildings in Munich after the end of World War II. Artworks that had been looted, confiscated, or sold in the art trade in the German Reich or in the areas

under its occupation between 1933 and 1945 were brought from the repositories where they were found to the MCCC to be inventoried and subsequently restituted. This concerned more than one million art objects.<sup>1</sup> Restitution of objects to their countries of origin or to private individuals in Germany and abroad was already taking place in the fall of 1945. All of the art works, with the exception of only a few thousand objects, were returned at that time—something that is unknown to most.

## **History of the Munich Central Collecting Point<sup>2</sup>**

Long before the end of World War II, the Americans had begun to consider how artworks, monuments, or buildings were to be dealt with after the war. The American Commission for the Protection and Salvage of Historic Monuments in War Areas—known after its chairman, Supreme Court Justice Owen J. Roberts, as the Roberts Commission—was already in place in August 1943.<sup>3</sup> It initially drew up lists of important structures and monuments so that these could be documented and protected where possible from destruction through military activities. The already-mentioned MFA&A was established in the fall of the following year to accompany the British and American invading armies with the task of protecting cultural property. To address the National Socialist policy of art looting after the war and to deal with related legal matters the Western Allies mutually agreed to establish an “international allied” commission for the protection and return of cultural property. This body’s founding laid the foundation for the creation of several collection sites for artworks—known as Central Collecting Points. Parallel to the work of the MFA&A officers, the American foreign intelligence service, the Office of Strategic Services (OSS), began in 1942, and later its subsidiary Art Looting Investigating Unit (ALIU), to gather information on persons involved in National Socialist art looting and the art market during the war. The work proved useful because many of them were later interrogated in special centers regarding their particular activities, with the findings made available to specialists at MCCC and other collecting points. Immediately after the war, the allied forces set up the largest of several collecting points in the two, for the most part undamaged, National Socialist Party buildings at Munich’s Königsplatz.<sup>4</sup> The former administration building was renamed “Gallery One”, the former “Führerbau” “Gallery Two.” In summer 1945 the Allies began removing the artworks from the many provisional repositories that the National Socialists had set up during the war. These repositories were located, among other places, in the salt mines near Altaussee in Bad Ischl as well as in monasteries and castles in Upper Bavaria and neighboring Austria. The Munich

CCP specialized in artworks from those repositories that were to be restituted to their countries of origin. Information on the number of artworks inventoried at the MCCC varies greatly, ranging from fifty thousand to over one million individual objects.<sup>5</sup>

The first director of the MCCC was Craig Hugh Smyth, an American officer and art historian, who had studied at Princeton University under Erwin Panofsky, among others. There were German as well as American art historians, librarians, photographers and others working at the MCCC. Under Smyth's guidance the staff developed the various property card systems used in documenting the objects.

Following inventorying, and as soon as the first provenances could be clarified, the MFA&A began as early as the fall of 1945 to return artworks to their countries of origin. The individual governments were themselves responsible for the actual return of the objects to their owners.<sup>6</sup> This was carried out in accordance with the agreements on domestic and foreign restitution undertaken by the western military governments.

### **Trustee Administration for Cultural Property (TVK) takes over MCCC Duties**

On August 31, 1948, the Americans transferred the duties of trusteeship, care, supervision, and maintenance of the objects and documents in the Munich CCP to the Bavarian Minister President. This initially did not affect the MCCC operations.<sup>7</sup> It was required of the trustee administration that cultural property entering into its possession be investigated for possible restitution obligations. Property identified for restitution was to be handed back to the U.S. authorities because the laws, directives, agreements, and orders from the Control Council and military government stated that restitution could only be carried out by the U.S. authorities. The MCCC activities ended on November 30, 1949. In order, though, that the German authorities could initiate further restitutions, the Conference of the Ministers of Culture resolved to form an office of restitution. As of 1951, the German restitution office carried out the restitution along with the Allied authorities. The office officially ended its activities on February 22, 1952.

On the same day in Munich, the objects previously under the trusteeship of the Bavarian Minister President were transferred to the West German Foreign Office's Department for Culture, which had been assigned the administration of the cultural property by the German chancellor. The Department for Culture established a special section, the Treuhandverwaltung von Kulturgut (TVK) [Trustee Administration of Cultural Property] under the Foreign Office, to which the Trustee Administration operating in Munich was subordinate. The remaining art

objects were handed over to the government of the Federal Republic of Germany on February 22, 1952.<sup>8</sup> The transfer also included microfilms of the MCCC files, all property cards from the Munich and Wiesbaden CCPs, and copies of the photographs of individual art objects — but not the negatives.

The TVK made new inventory cards for the property that it received from the MCCC, for the unrestituted property remaining in the MCCC at its closure known as the “Restbestand CCP” [Remaining MCCC Inventory].<sup>9</sup> The TVK made use of the English-language cards that they took over from the CCP for this task. Their new cards were in German and in duplicate, with one set arranged according to their Munich numbers and the other alphabetically according to the artist names. For this reason in Koblenz, there is one series of cards in English—the Property Cards Art—as well as two identical, but differently sorted series of German-language cards—known as Mü-cards [Mü for München-Nummer] . The Munich number file is almost complete for all art objects in the custody of the German government. The authors file, i.e. the artists file, however, contains extensive gaps.<sup>10</sup>

Also added to these holdings and inventoried by the TVK for the first time are 6,729 books and some 6,000 coins, which were originally “purchased” for the Sonderauftrag Linz. All of the art objects received were initially stored at repositories in and around Munich. The German Federal Minister of the Treasury took over the “Restbestand CCP” at the beginning of 1963, after the Trustee Administration was dissolved. The minister took on some 20,000 art works, including 2,708 paintings.<sup>11</sup> Since then, agencies subordinate to the Federal Ministry of Finance—initially the Oberfinanzdirektion (OFD) [Regional Finance Office] in Munich and currently the BADV—have been entrusted with the administration of these holdings.

In the mid-1960s, the Federal Minister of Finance began to consider how these holdings were to be handled in the future. Following extensive talks with museum directors and politicians an “Advisory Commission” was established officially constituted on January 14, 1965. In 1966 the German Parliament authorized the Federal Minister of Finance to make long-term loans (at no charge) of appropriate artworks to museums and to high- and middle-level government agencies. As a result, close to 2,000 works of art were made available to 111 German museums and 18 federal agencies.<sup>12</sup>

## **The Property Card System and the Photographic File at the MCCC and its successor institution, the Trustee Administration for Cultural Property (TVK)**

### ***MCCC Control Number File (Arrival Card File by Munich Number)***

Craig Hugh Smyth had developed an inventory card system during his short one-year-long term as MCCC director that was to remain in use until the collection point was dissolved.<sup>13</sup> Incoming crates and objects were assigned an accession number (Munich number) at the time of their delivery to the Collecting Point in Munich. Listed in addition to the accession number, were the artist, title, prior inventory numbers, arrival date, and condition of the object. Specific information about the art object is generally missing. The Arrival Card Mun.-40/1-27, for instance, reads “crate—large (27 items),”<sup>14</sup> which means that the crate was the fortieth object delivered to the Munich CCP and it in turn contained 27 art objects.

At the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz these Arrival Cards are designated as the “MCCC Control Number File (Arrival Card File by Munich Number)” in the Finding Aid for the TVK records (B 323). They include 43,189 Arrival Cards.<sup>15</sup>

### ***MCCC Restitution Card File by Munich Number or Property Cards***

After their registration on the Arrival Cards, the artworks were described in detail on the Property Cards Art.<sup>16</sup> If multiple items were registered under one Arrival Number then each object was now given an individual sub-number. The resulting Munich number—referred to as the Mü.-no.—with sub-number was transcribed on a concealed part of the object such as the back of a painting or applied-arts object.<sup>17</sup> In the case referred to above, the first object in the fortieth crate, a faience bowl, was marked “Mun. 40/1.”<sup>18</sup> Available information on the artist name, objects’s title, art form, size, prior inventory numbers, and evidence of provenance was entered on the card. The aforementioned bowl, for instance, was from the Seligmann collection in France. The entries were usually handwritten in English with later annotations in German. Two important aids available to the Americans in their efforts to identify the artworks were the library from the Sonderauftrag Linz and the Dresden Catalogue. These catalogues, consisting of file cards and photographs, list the art collected for the “Führermuseum,” which Hitler planned to erect in Linz.<sup>19</sup> They also had the detailed ERR inventories for those works of art that the ERR had processed in Paris in the Jeu de Paume.

Only a portion of the original Property Cards is now located in the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz. These are arranged by Munich numbers as the MCCC Restitution Card File [Sog.

Restitutionskartei nach Münchner Nummer] and also serve as the main file.<sup>20</sup> This record group contains 65,573 cards, including those Munich cards subsequently prepared in German by the TVK. After taking over the responsibility for inventorying and restitution of the art works from the American MFA&A officers in 1948, the TVK staff continued to use the available American Property Cards, adding their own annotations in German. New Munich cards were created for previously unregistered artworks. These included works from the Sonderauftrag Linz as well as ones from Herman Göring's art collection and acquisitions for the Obersalzberg near Berchtesgaden, the Deutsche Schloss [German Castle] in Posen, and Heinrich Hoffmann's collection. New inventory cards were made—this time in German—for these artworks newly arrived at the MCCP, according to their Munich-registration,<sup>21</sup> i.e., each newly arrived object received subsequent numbers. The American Property Cards were only translated if the object was still at the collecting point. The new main file in German, containing American Property Cards as well as the German-language cards, was organized numerically according to their Munich numbers.<sup>22</sup> Some of the German cards are to be found in the MCCP Restitution Card File at the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz, but most of the German-language inventory cards are kept at the BADV, in total 2,700

### ***Initial and subsequent Minister President Files***

Officers in the American cultural property protection unit entered “Minister President” in the card field for “presumed owner” or wrote “transf. to Min. Pres. decided by MFA Off. E. Breitenbach April 49”<sup>23</sup> on the cards for those artworks that were to be turned over to the German government in 1949. This concerned objects that had been acquired by the German Reich. A large portion of these artworks are today in the custody of the German government under the designation “Restbestand CCP.” The property card entries are typed in English and have German annotations. They contain data about the artwork but generally little about the provenance. This file is stored at the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz as the Initial Minister President File (updating discontinued January 1, 1962) [Alte Ministerpräsidentenkartei] with 9,702 property cards and the Minister President File (restituted objects) [Treuhänderschaft des Bayerischen Ministerpräsidenten - Restituierte Gegenstände] with 2,452 cards.<sup>24</sup>

### ***JRSO File***

The series of property cards maintained under the heading “JRSO” [Abgaben an die Jewish Restitution Successor Organization (JRSO)] lists those artworks that had been transferred to Jewish successor institutions such as the Jewish Restitution Successor Organization (JRSO), or the Jewish Cultural Reconstruction (JCR), the predecessors of the Conference on Jewish Material Claims Against Germany. The Bundesarchiv in Koblenz contains some 1,345 relevant cards.<sup>25</sup> The labeling is brief—similar to that of the two aforementioned property card series.

### ***Munich Property Cards, current “Restbestand CCP (Österreich)” [Remaining MCCP Inventory Austria]***

The transfer of the “Restbestand CCP (*Österreich*)” to Vienna in 1952 included property cards as well as artworks. The some 1,000 cards are now kept by the Austrian Bundesdenkmalamt [Federal Office for the Care of Monuments] and their scientific study is carried out by the Commission on Provenance Research.

### ***Photographs of Art Objects***

Subsequent to inventorying the objects in the MCCP, large format black-and-white photographs, including some detailed views, were made of the artworks and placed in a separate photographic file. The chief photographer, Johannes Felbermeyer, was assisted by Herbert List.<sup>26</sup> The images were fixed on cardboard and labeled with the respective Munich number. These objects, too, can only be identified in the main file through their Munich numbers and, where applicable, sub-numbers. The American MFA&A officers were able in some cases to make use of the “Führerbau” and the ERR photograph file [Fotothek]. This first file contained images of artworks that had been inventoried for the Sonderauftrag Linz. These photographs, taken by the photographers Rudolf Himpsl and Willy Schönbach between 1941 and 1944, are recognizable through their wide white borders.<sup>27</sup> The reverse side of those photographs show an inventory number stemming from the Sonderauftrag Linz, either handwritten or stamped, with an adjacently noted Munich number. Most of those Linz photographs are preserved at the BADV, in total 42,904. In the case of the ERR photographs, most of which had been prepared for objects in the French and Belgian collections processed in the Jeu de Paume in Paris, copies of the photographs were removed from the ERR

collection (found in Schloss Neuschwanstein) and added to the main MCCP photograph collection.

### ***Other Property Card Series***

In addition, other property card series were created, with cards arranged for the objects according to artist, country, and epoch, as well as to previous owners and depot room numbers. Since the cards in these additional files remaining in Koblenz contain only a few entries, detailed information on the individual objects can only be found in the main file. These cards do, however, contain information that is not recorded in the main file. The main file and the one arranged according to previous owners are in the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz. The previous-owner file is sorted according to country and covers only very large art collections.<sup>28</sup> Using this file, it is possible to establish which collections or individual works from collections went through the MCCP. Thumb-nail-sized photographs of the respective artworks are stapled to many of these cards in this series. It is known that the other property card series mentioned above are held at the U.S. National Archives in College Park, MD (NACP).

### **The Whereabouts of Various Property Card Series**

Numerous records from the Office of Military Government, U.S. Zone (OMGUS) were transferred to the U.S. Army Record Center in Kansas City, and some to the office of Ardelin Hall in the State Department after the Central Collecting Point in Munich closed in 1949.<sup>29</sup> These records were transferred to the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) in Washington, D.C. in the early 1960s. The cards from MCCP are now stored in the National Archives in College Park, MD (NACP), alphabetically sorted in four series according to different criteria such as the country to which the objects were returned; other destinations of transfer such as the High Commissioner for Austria (for works of Austrian provenance), Wiesbaden CCP, or the Minister President (for German state property), and therein under Munich number; and a separate series for those objects that were part of the Linz collections.<sup>30</sup> However, the originals are no longer available to researchers, and can be consulted only on microfilm. Those four MCCP series are still being processed and will soon be available as NARA Microfilm Publication M1946. The six different series of property cards art from Wiesbaden are available as NARA Microfilm Publication M1947.



In 1952 some 9,200 property cards and their associated artworks, which until then could not be restituted, were transferred via the Bavarian Minister President to the government of the Federal Republic of Germany.<sup>31</sup> The inventory of photographs from the former Collecting Point in Munich was also moved at this time. The German government handed the property cards and photographs over to the Oberfinanzdirektion (OFD) [Regional Finance Office] in Munich, which had been given administrative responsibility for the “Restbestand CCP” [Remaining MCCC Inventory]. Since 2006 the archival holdings of the BADV, successor organization to the OFD, include 2,717 property cards as well as two almost identical photographic portfolios, each containing some 43,000 images from the MCCC.<sup>32</sup> Property cards from art objects handed over to the property portfolios of high-level federal agencies and elsewhere were entered into the Restitution File. The reasoning behind the decision and the number of property cards involved are unknown.

The greatest portion by far of the cards remaining in Germany—probably some 170,000—have been stored since 1990 in the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz in the record group (Bestand) B 323.<sup>33</sup> The main, i.e., Restitution Card File by Munich Number, contains American Property Cards as well as the later German Mü cards. This file contains approx. 66,000 cards. The file in Koblenz has major gaps between the individual Munich numbers. Only a comparison of the two sets could establish whether the cards at the NACP are duplicates of those in Koblenz or if they represent ones missing there. This will be possible as soon as images of the property cards in the two archives are linked. Some 1,000 property cards ended up in Vienna with the transfer of the artworks of Austrian provenance remaining in the MCCC in 1952.<sup>34</sup> They are now held by the Bundesdenkmalamt and their study is carried out by the Commission on Provenance Research. There are also original property cards as well as copies in Paris, representing objects that were restituted to France. It is possible that additional undiscovered cards remain in other archives.

**The Administration of the “Restbestand CCP” [Remaining MCCC Inventory] by the Bundesamt für zentrale Dienste und offene Vermögensfragen (BADV) [Federal Office for Central Services and Unresolved Property Issues]**

Among its many tasks, the BADV has administrative responsibility for the “Restbestand CCP”, which since the mid 1960s has been in the hands of the German government. Currently this collection still contains about 2,300 paintings, graphic works, sculptures, and objects from the applied arts as well as some 10,000 coins and books. Most of these works are on loan to museums, which have committed themselves to the objects’ conservation and public

presentation. Until now, very few of the museums have returned the long-term loans to the federal agency, for these objects frequently represent a focal point within their collections. However, in several cases the BADV had to cancel the long-term loans because renewed provenance research resulted in the restitution of works to their former owners. The high-level federal agencies, on the other hand, have changed their holdings more often because, for instance, agencies merged or a new concept for the art on display was desired. Items were also returned to the government agency in an effort to avoid negative coverage in the press. This was then the case when, in spite of intensive research, it was impossible to establish the uninterrupted provenance and to completely exclude a sale by the previous owner due to National Socialist persecution.

Following the endorsement of the Washington Principles (1998) and the Common Statement (1999) a special department for provenance research established at the federal level took up its work in May 2000. This duty lay initially with of the Oberfinanzdirektion [Regional Finance Office] in Berlin and was transferred to the Bundesamt für offene Vermögensfragen (BARoV) [Federal Office for the Settlement of Unresolved Property Issues] at the beginning of 2004. The BADV has held the responsibility since January 1, 2006. It is intended that works of art shown by renewed research to involve a persecution-related deprivation of property during the National Socialist period be returned—also in cases where no claim to the asset has been made by the rightful owner or heirs.<sup>35</sup> In such cases the BADV endeavours to find the legal successors. Since the provenance research on the federal art inventory began in 2000, the origins of some 920 paintings, watercolors, and sculptures have been probed. So far, 24 works have been restituted and the return of 15 objects to the legal heirs is pending. A selection of the results to date is presented in the BADV database (<http://provenienz.badv.bund.de>) and linked with the MCCP database. The complete inventory can be viewed on the Koordinierungsstelle für Kulturgutverluste [Coordination Office for Lost Cultural Assets] website ([www.lostart.de](http://www.lostart.de)).

The point of departure for the renewed provenance research is the 2,700 German-language Mü.-cards from the Munich Central Collecting Point kept at the BADV for those artworks still in possession of the German government and centrally administered by the BADV.

## **The Munich Central Collecting Point Database on the Internet**

Our internal database on the Munich Central Collecting Point contains scanned images of all of the MCCP property cards made after the end of the war by the American MFA&A and the TVK staff in Munich and that are today in the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz with the exception of the Restitution Card File by Proprietor (B 323/695-729). Linked with each data file is a scan of the respective property card and in many cases the related photograph from the collections of photographs mentioned above. The database now makes it possible after more than 50 years to search without knowledge of the Munich inventory number for masterpieces from Leonardo da Vinci, Rubens or Cranach, for antique sculptures and objects from the applied arts such as furniture, tapestries, metalwork, faience ware and ceramics, as well as for books and numismatic objects. Now that it is possible to bring the inventory cards from the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz together with the photographs from BADV art administration archive with just a click, an almost unequivocal identification of the object on the basis of the photograph can be made. This is all the more interesting and important because the BADV collection of photographs was unknown to many researchers until today. Using the MCCP database it is possible to search according to different criteria such as (among others):

- Inventory number
- File / Inventory
- Object title
- Material / Technique
- Artist
- Keyword

Until now the large number of property cards sorted according to their Munich numbers made systematic research in the Bundesarchiv impossible. With an inquiry now being possible without knowledge of this number, the database represents an extremely important tool for provenance research as well as for investigation surrounding unsolved looted art cases. This applies to individual research inquiries as well as to the exploration of complex interrelationships such as those, for instance, in the art trade, through the use of the file cards from the Bundesarchiv.

With the original language having been transcribed, a search may produce more precise results if it is carried out for both the English and the German terms.

Two search fields are available:

- Search in specific fields
- Simple search in all marked fields

The database can serve to identify works that until now were not recognized as forced sales. In addition, it offers information on artworks that were returned to their owners after 1945 and that have not since been publicly exhibited. Database research can be carried out for artworks in museums or in private hands. The database is equally useful regarding those artworks known as the “Restbestand CCP” [Remaining M CCP Inventory], works that were transferred to the German government when the M CCP closed and that today are the object of BADV research.

In a period spanning some four months, staff from the Bundesministerium der Finanzen (BMF) [Federal Ministry of Finance] made 244,000 scans of the front and reverse sides of the cards in the Bundesarchiv and some 5,400 scans of the cards in the BADV archive. Blank reverse sides were not scanned; the reference “no entry” is to save storage capacity. Scans were not made of the Bundesarchiv’s “Restitution Card File by Proprietor” because the effort would have involved professional removal and remounting of the attached photographs, which would have been disproportionate to the amount of information gained.

After a thorough examination of the five series of digitalized property cards (the Control Number File (Arrival Card File by Munich Number), the Restitution Card File by Munich Number, and the Minister President, JRSO, and German Munich (Mü) card files), the DHM and BADV decided that the information contained in the “Restitution Card File by Munich Number”, i.e., the main file, should be transcribed for entry into the database because it contained the most extensive information on the respective artwork.<sup>36</sup> Information that is missing there can in any case be gained through inspection of the scans of the other property card series. All relevant data that were to be searchable as search terms were entered into an Access database following the scanning. After conclusion of the work, the DHM’s Central Documentation Department staff reformatted the Access database for use in the DHM database and carried out an initial automated data-conversion. In addition, the original data was supplemented with information / data from the DHM (Linz Collection and DHM object database) and linked with additional images. Within the framework of its cooperation agreement the DHM, the Zuse Institute in Berlin (ZIB) converted the augmented data for use on the Internet and developed a web application to search, display, and link the data and the scanned cards.

The Central Documentation Department at the DHM has so far performed only a cursory editing of the Access database entries. We have nonetheless decided to place the database online because a full-scale scholarly editing would take approximately four years. Choosing between waiting four years and placing the database with its flaws online was not difficult in the knowledge that the full-text search function will allow the objects to be located even if the entry is not properly placed. Spelling or orthographic mistakes in the names, however, will cause the full-text search to produce faulty results.

During the database development phase it was possible to establish contacts with European and American archives, contacts that had their beginnings at a workshop at the Getty Research Institute in Los Angeles in the fall of 2008. The Austrian Commission on Provenance Research, located on the premises of the Bundesdenkmalamt, offered shortly thereafter, for example, to digitalize its inventory of one thousand cards from the Munich CCP for inclusion in the database. This cooperation also closes some gaps in the property cards on file at the Bundesarchiv. In addition, talks on possible cooperation with the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) were already taking place at the end of 2008. In spring 2009 the NARA indicated its openness to a collaborative effort. This can first be undertaken, however, after NARA has finished digitalizing its stock of property cards, presumably at the end of 2009. With that work finished, it would be possible to link the NARA data with the MCCP database and to take a further step in reconstructing the holdings in the Munich Central Collecting Point. Also of interest would be a linking with the Holocaust Museum, which is preparing a database of the ca. 20,000 registration cards prepared in the Jeu de Paume in Paris by the Einsatzstab Reichsleiter Rosenberg (ERR) [Operational Staff Rosenberg]; many of the MCCP cards bear ERR code numbers. In addition, the Zentralinstitut für Kunstgeschichte [Central Institute for Art History] in Munich agreed to collaborate. Its photographic library contains some 4,300 images from the MCCP. Following a comparison, these photographs will be also linked with the MCCP database.<sup>37</sup> It is possible that still more collections of MCCP property cards and photographs are located in other archives. Relevant information would be greatly appreciated and can be communicated to Monika Flacke at [ccp@dhm.de](mailto:ccp@dhm.de).

## **Conclusion**

The online release of the M CCP database allows the free research of approx. 170,000 entries as well as approx. 300,000 images (property cards and object photographs) not only through their Munich numbers but also using the search criteria listed above. Such a database is intended to serve not only the research into provenance but also that being carried out at universities on the art trade and art looting. Several such projects are currently being promoted, such as, for instance, the “Entartete Kunst” [Degenerate Art] Research Center at the universities in Hamburg and Berlin. Professor Uwe Fleckner and Professor Klaus Krüger have overseen the development in this area of doctoral and master’s theses topics on the methods of National Socialist cultural policy. The Research Center has also entered a cooperation agreement with the Getty Research Institute and the University of Southern California, which jointly founded the “The Art Market in Germany, Austria and Switzerland, 1900–1955” working group. A database focusing on the art market sales in the 1930s and 40s is to serve as the foundation for individual research projects and conferences.

## Endnotes

<sup>1</sup> This number is mentioned at [www.archives.gov/research/microfilm/m1940.pdf](http://www.archives.gov/research/microfilm/m1940.pdf) , p. 4 [Jan. 22, 2009]. This microfilm publication, M1940, reproduces approximately 6,000 property cards and accompanying survey reports regarding German repositories that stored Nazi-confiscated works of art. These cards are not the M CCP property cards which will be presented in Microfilm Publication M1946 (not on-line available yet).

<sup>2</sup> This project is indebted to Dr. Patricia Kennedy Grimsted of Harvard Ukrainian Research Institute. Without Grimsted's indefatigable energy and passion for understanding all aspects of the post-war collecting point materials as reflected in the different versions of these sources from archives on several continents and countries, we would not have been able to achieve the breadth and depth of the introduction of this database.

<sup>3</sup> Regarding the Allies' deliberations on how to deal with cultural property after World War II, see Hanns Christian Löhner, *Das Braune Haus der Kunst. Hitler und der "Sonderauftrag Linz"*, (Berlin: 2005), pp. 65-70.

<sup>4</sup> For in-depth information on the Munich Central Collecting Point see Iris Lauterbach, „Arche Noah“, „Museum ohne Besucher“?—Der Central Art Collecting Point in München [ Noah's Ark—Museum without Visitors?—The Central Art Collecting Point in Munich], *Entehrt. Ausgeplündert. Arisiert. Entrechtung und Enteignung der Juden*, ed. Andrea Baresel-Brand. (Magdeburg: Coordination Office for Lost Cultural Assets, 2005), pp. 335-352. In addition to the CCP in Munich, there were Collecting Points in Berlin, Celle, Marburg, Offenbach and Wiesbaden (see Löhner 2005, p. 69; see note 3). In June 1946 only three of the Collecting Points remained and each was specialized. The Wiesbaden CCP, for instance, took on mainly artworks of German ownership, especially from the former Prussian State Museums, the Städel Institute in Frankfurt, and the local Wiesbaden museums, inventorying 700,000 objects. The CCP in Offenbach, the Offenbach Archival Depot (OAD), was specialized in Jewish materials and contained more than 2.5 million religious items, books, and archives. The third, and largest, was the Munich CCP. See remarks in M1940. Records concerning the central collecting points (“Ardelia Hall Collection”): Miscellaneous property reports, 1945 – 1948 from NARA, Washington, D.C. 2004; online [www.archives.gov/research/microfilm/m1940.pdf](http://www.archives.gov/research/microfilm/m1940.pdf), p. 2 [January 22, 2009] (see note 1). For more details see the NARA Microfilm Publication M1946 (in process). M1946 holds *Records Concerning the Central Collecting Points (“Ardelia Hall Collection”): Munich Central Collecting Point, 1945-1950*. Records of the United States Occupation Headquarters, World War II. Record Group 260. Washington, DC: NARA, 2009 (forthcoming).

<sup>5</sup> In the activity report of the Treuhandverwaltung von Kulturgut (TVK) in Munich for 1962, 50,000 (matches the number of Munich numbers) and 1,000,000 are mentioned, see Bundesarchiv, B 323/762, TVK activity report by Dr. Hoffmann, 1.10.1962, p. 27. The *AAM Guide*, on the other hand, mentions from 150,000 to more than 1,000,000 objects, see Nancy H. Yeide, Konstantin Akinsha, Amy L. Walsh, *The AAM Guide to Provenance Research* (Washington, D.C.: 2001), p. 95. In the commentary on the NARA holdings a figure of one million is mentioned, see [www.archives.gov/research/microfilm/m1940.pdf](http://www.archives.gov/research/microfilm/m1940.pdf), p. 2 [January 22, 2009] (see note 1).

<sup>6</sup> On objects returned from the MCCP see, e.g., Löhr 2005, pp. 75-81 (see note 3). For in-depth information see Michael Joseph Kurtz, *Nazi contraband. American policy on the return of European cultural treasures 1945-1955*, (New York: Garfield, 1985), and the more recent, updated book by Michael J. Kurtz, *America and the Return of Nazi Contraband: the recovery of Europe's cultural treasures* (Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

<sup>7</sup> For the following see the TVK activity report for 1962 (see note 5).

<sup>8</sup> Letter from the Bayerische Staatsgemäldesammlungen [Bavarian State Painting Collections] to Foreign Office Department of Culture, February 22, 1952. On 43 pages 9.244 property cards are listed, whereby multiple objects could be listed under each Munich number. The transfer was based on the exchange of notes between the U.S. high commissioner McCloy and the German chancellor Konrad Adenauer, between April 16 and August 27, 1951, as well as a note from the German chancellor to the minister president of Bavaria on January 4, 1952. A copy is in the TVK records in the BADV archive.

<sup>9</sup> See letter to German Foreign Office of February 22, 1952, p. 24 (see note 8).

<sup>10</sup> The property cards for the artworks in German government possession are in the BADV archives. The holdings arranged according to Munich numbers consist of some 2,700 property cards. The property cards ordered alphabetically by artist name are far fewer, with their exact number currently unknown. In the Bundesarchiv the German-language Munich property cards in the MCCP Restitution Card File by Munich Numbers are, on the other hand, each filed behind the English-language Property Card. See Bundesarchiv, record group [Bestand] B 323/647-694.

<sup>11</sup> A summary compilation of the objects, sorted by art form, was produced by Klaus Beetz, former head (1990–2001) of the OFD department in charge of administering the Federal art collection. See Klaus Beetz, *Die Erwerbungen Adolf Hitlers bis zum Führererlass vom 26. Juni 1939 für den Aufbau des Neuen Museums Linz* (Berlin: Eigenverlag, 2004), p. 67. Petropoulos speaks, on the other hand, of 4,500 paintings, see Jonathan Petropoulos, “For



Sale: A Troubled Legacy,” *ARTnews*, June 2001, 114-120, see 115. The editors would at this point like to express their thanks to Dr. Beetz for his valuable leads regarding the activity of the TVK.

<sup>12</sup> See Beetz, 2004, pp. 67-71 (see note 11).

<sup>13</sup> Regarding the inventorying see Craig Hugh Smyth, *Repatriation of Art from the Collecting Point in Munich after World War II* (Maarsen/Den Haag: 1988), p. 95.

<sup>14</sup> Bundesarchiv, B 323/604, Mun. 40/1-27, Front. The reverse side is blank, as is generally true for all Arrival Cards.

<sup>15</sup> See Bundesarchiv, Inventory B 323/604 to 646. Exact information on the property cards has only been available since their digitalization.

<sup>16</sup> In the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz these property cards are designated as the MCCP Restitution Card File by Munich Number in the finding aid for the record group referred to, see Bundesarchiv, B 323/647-694.

<sup>17</sup> The inventory numbers on the Arrival and Property Cards as well as those on the Munich cards are referred to as Mü. [for München = Munich]-numbers.

<sup>18</sup> Bundesarchiv, B 323/647, Mun. 40/1.

<sup>19</sup> The Dresden Catalogue is often confused with the Führerbau file in the professional literature. See the remarks on these archives by Löhr 2005, p. 2 (see note 3). The Dresden Catalogue’s contents can be viewed in the Sonderauftrag Linz database, also presented by the DHM.

<sup>20</sup> See Bundesarchiv, B 323/647-694.

<sup>21</sup> For the following see the TVK activity report for 1962, pp. 23-28 (see note 5).

<sup>22</sup> See note 10.

<sup>23</sup> See in the following also the remarks from by Yeide, Akinsha und Walsh, 2001, p. 95 and p. 62 (see note 5).

<sup>24</sup> See Bundesarchiv, B 323/763-769 as well as B 323/602 and 603.

<sup>25</sup> See Bundesarchiv, B 323/732.

<sup>26</sup> While the major portion of the collecting point photographs are stored at the BADV, other photos are located at the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C, Photographic Archives, Core Collection, Munich Central Collecting Point as well as among the Felbermeyer images at the Getty Research Institute (GRI), Los Angeles, see Löhr 2005, p. 103 (note 3).

Felbermeyer, who was the chief photographer at the MCCP from 1945 to 1949, made numerous black-and-white photos of the persons working there while also recording the inventoried artworks, see Felbermeyer photographs for the Munich Central Collecting Point,

(accession number 89.P.4) in the Research Library of the GRI. The Herbert List photographs are in the collection of Max Scheler, Hamburg. The BADV photographs are not labeled, so an attribution is only possible with the Felbermeyer and List photos in the GRI and LACMA. In Felbermeyer's case, however, the Getty Research Institute has comparatively few images, so only a fraction of the photographs he made would be identifiable.

<sup>27</sup> Löhr 2005, p. 96 (see note 3).

<sup>28</sup> At the Bundesarchiv in Koblenz this group is designated in the inventory as the "MCCP Restitution Card File by Proprietor" [Restitutionskartei nach Eigentümern], see Bundesarchiv, B 323/695-729. These property cards are stored in 35 drawers at the Bundesarchiv. The exact number of cards is unknown because the group was not scanned. Presuming that the property card inventory is stored in boxes containing approx. 1,300 to 1,500 cards each, this group can be assumed to contain approximately 45,000 to 52,000 cards.

<sup>29</sup> The exact number is available after the digitization is finished.

<sup>30</sup> These holdings are described in M1946 in NARA (see note 4).

<sup>31</sup> See the letter from the Bayerische Staatsgemäldesammlungen [Bavarian State Painting Collections] to Foreign Office Department of Culture, February 22, 1952 (see note 8).

<sup>32</sup> These 2,717 index cards list those artworks from the "Restbestand CCP" that are administered by the BADV.

<sup>33</sup> This includes the Arrival and Property Cards (see notes 15 and 16) as well as the Minister President files (see note 24), the JRSO file (see note 25), and the Restitution Card File by Proprietor (see note 28), which are all located in the Bundesarchiv.

<sup>34</sup> See the TVK activity report for 1962, p. 10 (see note 5).

<sup>35</sup> On provenance research in the federal agencies see Harald König, "Erste Ergebnisse der Provenienzrecherche zu dem in Bundesbesitz befindlichen Restbestand CCP - Das Ölgemälde 'Die Milchfrau' von Daniel Chodowiecki" [First Results of Provenance Research on the Remaining MCCP Inventory Artworks in Possession of the Federal Government (Germany)—The Oil Painting 'The Milkmaid' by Daniel Chodowiecki] in: *Beiträge öffentlicher Einrichtungen der Bundesrepublik Deutschland zum Umgang mit Kulturgütern aus ehemaligem jüdischen Besitz*, vol. 1, edited by Ulf Häder (Magdeburg, Koordinierungsstelle für Kulturgutverluste Magdeburg, 2001) and Harald König, "Leihgaben der Bundesrepublik Deutschland aus Beständen, die zwischen 1933 - 1945 in Reichsbesitz gelangten" [Items on loan by the Federal Republic of Germany that came into the Possession of the German Reich between 1933–1945] in: *Museen im Zwielicht. Ankaufspolitik 1933-1945. Kolloquium vom 11.-12. Dezember 2001 in Köln; die eigene GESCHICHTE\**.

*Provenienzforschung an deutschen Kunstmuseen im internationalen Vergleich. Tagung vom 20.-22. Februar 2002 in Hamburg*, edited by Ulf Häder, with assistance from Katja Terlau and Ute Haug (Magdeburg, Koordinierungsstelle für Kulturgutverluste Magdeburg, 2002) pp. 149-158.

<sup>36</sup> See in this regard the remarks in the section, “The Property Card System and the Photographic File at the M CCP and its successor institution, the Trustee Administration for Cultural Property (TVK)”.

<sup>37</sup> The editors would like to express their thanks to Dr. Ralph Peters, who helped to arrange the digitalization of the photographs.

### **Bibliography**

Beetz, Klaus, *Die Erwerbungen Adolf Hitlers bis zum Führererlass vom 26. Juni 1939 für den Aufbau des Neuen Museums Linz*. Berlin: Eigenverlag, 2004.

König, Harald, “Erste Ergebnisse der Provenienzrecherche zu dem in Bundesbesitz befindlichen Restbestand CCP - Das Ölgemälde "Die Milchfrau" von Daniel Chodowiecki” [First Results of the Provenance Research on the Remaining M CCP Inventory Artworks in Possession of the Federal Government (Germany)—The Oil Painting ‘The Milkmaid’ by Daniel Chodowiecki], *Beiträge öffentlicher Einrichtungen der Bundesrepublik Deutschland zum Umgang mit Kulturgütern aus ehemaligem jüdischen Besitz*, Vol. 1, ed. Ulf Häder. Magdeburg: Koordinierungsstelle für Kulturgutverluste Magdeburg, 2001.

König, Harald, “Leihgaben der Bundesrepublik Deutschland aus Beständen, die zwischen 1933 - 1945 in Reichsbesitz gelangten” [Items on loan by the Federal Republic of Germany that came into Possession of the Reich between 1933–1945], *Museen im Zwielficht. Ankaufspolitik 1933-1945. Kolloquium vom 11.-12. Dezember 2001 in Köln; die eigene GESCHICHTE\**. *Provenienzforschung an deutschen Kunstmuseen im internationalen Vergleich. Tagung vom 20.-22. Februar 2002 in Hamburg*. Edited by Ulf Häder, with assistance from Katja Terlau and Ute Haug. Magdeburg: Koordinierungsstelle für Kulturgutverluste Magdeburg, 2002.

Kurtz, Michael J., *Nazi Contraband : American policy on the return of European cultural treasures 1945-1955*, New York 1985.

Michael J. Kurtz, *America and the Return of Nazi Contraband: the recovery of Europe's cultural treasures* (Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

Lauterbach, Iris, „Arche Noah“, „Museum ohne Besucher“? – Der Central Art Collecting Point in München [Noah's Ark—Museum without Visitors? – The Central Art Collecting Point in Munich], *Entehrt. Ausgeplündert. Arisiert. Entrechtung und Enteignung der Juden*, ed. Andrea Baresel-Brand. Magdeburg: Coordination Office for Lost Cultural Assets at Magdeburg, 2005.

Löhr, Hanns Christian, *Das Braune Haus der Kunst. Hitler und der „Sonderauftrag Linz“* Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 2005.

Petropoulos, Jonathan, “For Sale: A Troubled Legacy,” in: *ARTnews*, June 2001, pp. 114-120  
Smyth, Craig Hugh, *Repatriation of Art from the Collecting Point in Munich after World War II* (Maarsen/Den Haag: 1988).

Yeide, Nancy H., Konstantin Akinsha, Amy L. Walsh, *The AAM Guide to Provenance Research* (Washington, D.C. 2001).

### **Archives**

-Bundesamt für zentrale Dienste und offene Vermögensfragen (BADV) [Federal Office for Central Services and Unresolved Property Issues], Berlin, Archive of the Art Administration

-Bundesarchiv [Federal Archive], record group B 323

- Bundesdenkmalamt/Kommission für Provenienzforschung, Wien [Federal Office for the Care of Monuments/Commission on Provenance Research, Vienna]

- Max Scheler, Hamburg, Herbert List bequest

-National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, D.C. and U.S. National Archives, College Park, Maryland

-National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C, Photographic Archives, Core Collection, Munich Central Collecting Point

-Research Library des Getty Research Institute, Felbermeyer photographs for the Central Collecting Point, Munich (accession number 89.P.4)

-Zentralinstitut für Kunstgeschichte [Central Institute for Art History], Photothek

### **Abbreviations**

BADV	Bundesamt für zentrale Dienste und offene Vermögensfragen [Federal Office for Central Services and Unresolved Property Issues]
BARoV	Bundesamt für offene Vermögensfragen [Federal Office for the Settlement of Unresolved Property Issues]
BMF	Bundesministerium der Finanzen
DHM	Deutsches Historisches Museum [German Historical Museum]
ERR	Einsatzstab Reichsleiter Rosenberg [Operational Staff Rosenberg]
GRI	Getty Research Institute
MCCP	Munich Central Collecting Point
MFA&A	Monuments, Fine Arts and Archives Service [of the American allied forces]
Mü.-Nr.	Münchener Nummer [Munich Number]
NACP	National Archives at College Park
NARA	National Archives and Records Administration
OFD	Oberfinanzdirektion [Regional Finance Office]
OSS	Office for Strategic Services
TVK	Treuhandverwaltung von Kulturgut beim Auswärtigen Amt [Trustee Administration for Cultural Property at the Foreign Office]
ZIB	Zuse Institute Berlin
ZIVIT	Zentrum für Informationsverarbeitung und Informationstechnik [Central Information Processing and Information Technology], office Berlin